**APPROVED Minutes**

**Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 7620 Metro Center Drive – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Thursday, April 11, 2019 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*Members:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services |  |
| Blakey, Eric | Just Energy |  |
| Coleman, Diana | OPUC |  |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy |  |
| Greer, Clayton | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Gross, Blake | AEP Service Corporation |  |
| Haley, Ian | Luminant Generation |  |
| Heino, Shari | Brazos Electric Cooperative |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor |  |
| Paff, Tom | Duke Energy |  |
| Trevino, Melissa | Occidental Chemical |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Denton Municipal Electric | Alt. Rep. for Smith Day |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Guests:* | |  | |  |
| Abbott, Kristin | | PUCT | | Via Teleconference |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | | NRG | | Via Teleconference |
| Boisseau, Heather | | LCRA | | Via Teleconference |
| Bridges, Robert | | CenterPoint Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Bryant, Mark | | PUCT | | Via Teleconference |
| Bunch, Kevin | | EDF Energy Services | |  |
| Checkly, Jim | | Cross Texas Transmission | |  |
| Ciccone, Nico | | NextEra Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Cook, Tim | | Cross Texas Transmission | | Via Teleconference |
| Cortez, Sarai | | Sharyland | |  |
| Cripe, Ramsey | | Schneider Engineering | | Via Teleconference |
| Daigneault, Ralph | | Potomac Economics | |  |
| Downey, Marty | | Electranet Power | |  |
| Garza, Beth | | Potomac Economics | |  |
| Greg, Michele | | TCPA | |  |
| Goff, Eric | | CitiGroup | |  |
| Helton, Bob | | ENGIE | |  |
| Huber, Grant | | Cypress Creek Renewables | | Via Teleconference |
| Jewell, Michael | | Jewell and Associates | | Via Teleconference |
| Jolley, Emily | | LCRA | |  |
| Jonhson, Ryan | | Aces Power | | Via Teleconference |
| Juricek, Mike | | Oncor | | Via Teleconference |
| Krupka, Catherine | | Sutherland | | Via Teleconference |
| Lange, Clif | | South Texas Electric Cooperative | | Via Teleconference |
| Lee, Jim | | AEP Service Corporation | |  |
| Martin, Collin | | Oncor | |  |
| Mathew, Paul | | CenterPoint Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Morris, Sandy | | Direct Energy | |  |
| Ottaway, Cindy | | CTT | | Via Teleconference |
| Pak, Sam | | Oncor | |  |
| Powell, Christian | | Pedernales Electric Cooperative | |  |
| Rehfeldt, Diana | | Texas New Mexico Power | | Via Teleconference |
| Reed, Carolyn | | CenterPoint Energy | | Via Teleconference |
| Reid, Walter | | Advanced Power Alliance | |  |
| Rich, Katie | | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative | |  |
| Rainwater, Kim | | Environmental Defense Fund | |  |
| Robertson, Jennifer | | LCRA | |  |
| Sams, Bryan | | Lone Star Transmission | |  |
| Scott, Kathy | | CenterPoint Energy | |  |
| Shaw, Marka | | Exelon | |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | | Crescent Power | |  |
| Sithuraj, Murali | | Austin Energy | |  |
| Smith, Caitlin | | Invenergy | |  |
| Smith, Chris | | Austin Energy | |  |
| Stanfield, Leonard | | Invenergy | |  |
| Thompson, David | | Pedernales Electric Cooperative | | Via Teleconference |
| Tran, Diane | Texas Industrial Energy Consumers | |  | |
| Van Booven, Ashley | New Braunfels Utilities | | Via Teleconference | |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor | |  | |
| Wall, Kim | Hansen Technologies | | Via Teleconference | |
| Watson, Mark | SP Global | | Via Teleconference | |
| Whittington, Pam | Jewell and Associates | |  | |
| Whittle, Brandon | Calpine | |  | |
| Younger, Joseph | Texas Reliability Entity | | Via Teleconference | |
|  |  | |  | |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  | |  | |
| Albracht, Brittney |  | |  | |
| Anderson, Troy |  | |  | |
| Bethke, Ponda |  | | Via Teleconference | |
| Billo, Jeff |  | |  | |
| Bivens, Carrie |  | |  | |
| Blevins, Bill |  | |  | |
| Bonser, Drew |  | |  | |
| Boren, Ann |  | |  | |
| Bracy, Phil | |  | |  |
| Castillo, Leo | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy | |  | |  |
| Day, Betty | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Gleason, Brandon | |  | |  |
| Fohn, Doug | |  | |  |
| Hobbs, Kristi | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Hull, Gibson | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Levine, Jon | |  | |  |
| Loera, Amy | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Mago, Nitika | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Mele, Cheryl | |  | |  |
| Morehead, Juliana | |  | |  |
| Ögelman, Kenan | |  | |  |
| Phillips, Cory | |  | |  |
| Raish, Carl | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Rickerson, Woody | |  | |  |
| Rosel, Austin | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Ruane, Mark | |  | |  |
| Scott, Vicki | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Shaw, Pam | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Nathan | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Solis, Stephen | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Stice, Clayton | |  | |  |
| Teixeira, Jay | |  | |  |
| Thomas, Shane | |  | |  |
| Thompson, Chad | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Wattles, Paul | |  | |  |
| Xiao, Hong | |  | | Via Teleconference |
| Zeplin, Rachel | |  | |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments were present for a vote.*

Martha Henson called the April 11, 2019 PRS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Henson directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-1)

*March 14, 2019*

**Diana Coleman moved to approve the March 14, 2019 meeting minutes as submitted. Eric Blakey seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) and Board Report

Ms. Henson reported the disposition of Revision Requests considered at the March 27, 2019 TAC and April 9, 2019 Board meetings. Ms. Henson stated that TAC approved 2019 PRS Goals.

Project Update and Summary of Project Priority List (PPL) Activity to Date (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided a project update and summary of PPL activity, reviewed the 2019 release targets and project spending, and presented the priority and rank options for Revision Requests requiring projects. Mr. Anderson and Kenan Ögelman responded to questions from Market Participants.

Annual Review of Other Binding Document List

Ms. Henson reminded Market Participants of the March 14, 2019 PRS discussion regarding the annual

obligation to review the list of Other Binding Documents, presented the current list, and stated that the Reliability and Operations Subcommittee (ROS) has asked the Network Data Support Working Group (NDSWG) to consider potential repositories for the ERCOT Nodal ICCP Communication Handbook.

**Blake Gross moved to recommend approval of the current list of Other Binding Documents. Eric Goff seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Urgency Vote

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 930, Weekly RUC Modifications for Forecasted Emergency Conditions*

Mr. Goff reviewed the Revision Request timeline and requested urgent status so that NPRR930 could be considered at the June 11, 2019 ERCOT Board meeting. Mr. Ögelman summarized the 4/11/19 ERCOT comments and encouraged Market Participants to consider the issues and potential solutions at the April 23, 2019 workshop on Outage activity related to Operating Condition Notices (OCNs).

**Mr. Goff moved to grant NPRR930 Urgent status. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried with the three abstentions from the Consumer (Occidental), Independent Generator (Calpine) and Municipal (CPS Energy) Market Segments.**

Mr. Goff reviewed the merits of NPRR930. Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed potential gaps in NPRR930, impacts from a potential redesign of the Weekly Reliability Unit Commitment (WRUC) process and/or the Outage Scheduler system, incentives and potential gaming, accuracy of Current Operating Plan (COP) data submittals in advance of an emergency condition, setting an offer floor for the Resource at the System-Wide Offer Cap (SWCAP), and possible interactions between NPRR930 and three Revision Requests ERCOT is developing. Market Participants requested additional time to review the issues and an opportunity to consider the issues prior to the May 9, 2019 PRS meeting.

**Bill Barnes moved to table NPRR930. Bob Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Ms. Henson announced the May 1, 2019 PRS meeting to consider NPRR930 as well as the normal PRS agenda.

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization

*NPRR885, Must-Run Alternative (MRA) Details and Revisions Resulting from PUCT Project No. 46369, Rulemaking Relating to Reliability Must-Run Service*

Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed the Impact Analysis and appropriate priority and rank for NPRR885.

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 3/14/19 PRS Report and the Impact Analysis for NPRR885 with a recommended priority of 2019 and rank of 220. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR896, Reliability Must-Run and Must-Run Alternative Evaluation Process*

*NPRR923, Revision to Weather Responsiveness Determination Process*

*NPRR924, Addition of Form to Section 23 - IMRE Application for Registration*

**Mr. Greer moved to endorse and forward to TAC the respective 3/14/19 PRS Reports and Impact Analyses for NPRR896, NPRR923, and NPRR924. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*System Change Request (SCR) 799, ERCOT Outage Study Cases in the System Operations Test Environment (SOTE)*

Market Participants reviewed the 4/4/19 ERCOT comments requesting more time to develop the Impact Analysis.

**Mr. Greer moved to table SCR799. Marty Downey seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR826, Mitigated Offer Caps for RMR Resources*

*NPRR838, Updated O&M Cost for RMR Resources*

*NPRR849, Clarification of the Range of Voltage Set Points at a Generation Resource’s POI*

*NPRR904, Revisions to Real-Time On-Line Reliability Deployment Price Adder for ERCOT-Directed Actions Related to DC Ties*

*NPRR918, Validation Clarification for PTP Obligations with Links to an Option*

*NPRR919, Exemption from Governor Primary Frequency Response Control for Certain Resources in Private Use Networks*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR823, Amend the Definition of an Affiliate*

Market Participants requested additional time to consider the different affiliate definitions in the ERCOT Bylaws, Protocols, and Public Utility Regulatory Act (PURA). PRS took no action on this item.

*NPRR902, ERCOT Critical Energy Infrastructure Information*

Jon Levine summarized the 3/13/19 ERCOT comments, stated that ERCOT intends to host a third workshop, and encouraged Market Participants to submit comments regarding the Creating Party concept and intra-organizational sharing, particularly regarding the burdens that would potentially be imposed on Market Participants as a result of those proposals, prior to the workshop. Ms. Henson stated Oncor is developing additional clarifications. PRS took no action on this item.

*NPRR903, Day-Ahead Market Timing Deviations*

Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed the history of NPRR903 and the current discussions at the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS). PRS took no action on this item.

*NPRR872, Modifying the SASM Shadow Price Cap*

Market Participants summarized the history of NPRR872 and discussed its utility in consideration of implementing Real-Time Co-optimization (RTC). Some Market Participants expressed concern amount of time NPRR872 has been in the stakeholder process and the lack of consensus. Other Market Participants expressed support for implementing NPRR872 as an interim solution.

**Brandon Whittle moved to reject NPPR872. Ian Haley seconded the motion.** Market Participants requested additional time to review the issues.

**Jennifer Robertson moved to table NPRR872 for one month. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion to table NPRR872 for one month carried via roll call vote, with eight objections from the Independent Generator (5) (Luminant, ENGIE, Calpine, Invenergy, and Duke), Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (2) (Reliant and Just Energy), and Investor Owned Utility (IOU) (AEP) Market Segments and one abstention from the Municipal (DME) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.[[2]](#footnote-2))*

*NPRR913, Generator Interconnection Neutral Project Classification*

Walter Reid reviewed the history of NPRR913. Jeff Billo summarized the three potential ERCOT solutions and discussions at previous Planning Working Group (PLWG) meetings. Market Participants reviewed the 4/5/19 ROS comments and discussed the reliability and policy issues. Some Market Participants expressed concern for the solution proposed in NPRR913 and objected to shifting developmental risk and potential costs to consumers. Proponents of NPRR913 stated that the solution provides more clarity around the process and gives Generators reasonable access to the market.

**Mr. Greer moved to recommend approval of NPRR913 as amended by the 4/5/19 ROS comments. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion to recommend approval of NPRR913 as amended by the 4/5/19 ROS comments failed via roll call vote, with ten objections from the Consumer (Occidental), Cooperative (3) (Brazos, LCRA, STEC), Independent Generator (3) (Luminant, Exelon, Calpine), and IREP (3) (Reliant, Electranet, Just Energy) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed the Revision Request process. Ms. Henson requested additional time for Transmission Service Providers (TSPs) to consider additional clarifications for neutral projects.

**Ms. Henson moved to table NPRR913. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion failed via roll call vote, with seven from the Consumer (Occidental), Cooperative (STEC), Independent Generator (3) (Luminant, Exelon, Calpine), IREP (Reliant), and Municipal (DME) Market Segments, and two abstentions from the Cooperative (LCRA) and Municipal (CPS Energy) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Due to the lack of a subsequent successful motion, NPRR913 was deemed rejected by PRS pursuant to paragraph (4) of Section 21.4.4, Protocol Revision Subcommittee Review and Action.

*NPRR917, Nodal Pricing for Settlement Only Distribution Generators (SODGs) and Settlement Only Transmission Generators (SOTGs)*

Market Participants reviewed NPRR917 and the 4/4/19 ERCOT comments and debated the grandfathering and opt-out provisions. Some Market Participants expressed concern for continuing to allow SODGs and SOTGs to use Load Zone pricing for such an extended period of time. Grant Huber stated that Cypress Creek Renewables would incur financial impacts from contractual obligations if NPRR917 was implemented with a 20 year expiration date. Other Market Participants expressed concern for limiting commercial market activity and opined that both 20 and 40 years were an extended period of time. Beth Garza discussed the timeline, reminded Market Participants that the increased capacity from these Generators is approximately 40 MWs, and stated that the issue of regulatory oversight has been considered.

**Mr. Barnes moved to recommend approval of NPRR917 as amended by the 4/4/19 ERCOT comments. Mr. Downey seconded the motion.**

**Mr. Whittle moved to amend the main motion to recommend approval of NPRR917 as amended by**

**the 4/4/19 ERCOT comments with an expiration date of January 1, 2040. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion to amend the main motion failed via roll call vote, with eight from the Cooperative (STEC), Independent Generator (2) (ENGIE, Invenergy), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (2) (Tenaska, Citigroup), IREP (Reliant, Electranet) and Municipal (CPS Energy) Market Segments and two abstentions from the Consumer (Occidental) and IREP (Just Energy) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

**The motion to recommend approval of NPRR917 as amended by the 4/4/19 ERCOT comments carried via roll call vote with two objections from the Independent Generator (Calpine) and IPM (Morgan Stanley) Market Segments, and two abstentions from the Independent Generator (Luminant) and IREP (Just Energy) Market Segments.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.[[3]](#footnote-3))*

*NPRR926, Removal of 90-Day Period Between SSR Study Approval and Synchronization*

**Mr. Barnes moved to recommend approval of NPRR926 as amended by the 4/8/19 Oncor comments. Mr. Gross seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR928, Cybersecurity Incident Notification*

Brandon Gleason reviewed NPRR928. Some Market Participants expressed concern for duplicative efforts in reporting an event and the proposed delivery method, and opined that the proposed definitions were overly broad and not specific to grid reliability. Market Participants and ERCOT Staff discussed potential forums to further review NPRR928. Market Participants requested ERCOT facilitate a workshop for further review of the issues and that stakeholders raise specific concerns regarding NPRR928 to the attention of the Critical Infrastructure Protection Working Group (CIPWG).

**Mr. Goff moved to table NPRR928. Mr. Greer seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.**

*NPRR929, PTP Obligations with Links to an Option DAM Award Eligibility*

Mr. Barnes summarized NPRR929. Market Participants reviewed the 4/9/19 Luminant comments. In response to Market Participant questions, Carrie Bivens stated NPRR929 would require a system change for implementation.

**Mr. Barnes moved to recommend approval of NPRR929 as amended by the 4/9/19 Luminant comments. Ms. Robertson seconded the motion. The motion carried with one abstention from the IPM (Morgan Stanley) Market Segment.**

Resource Definition Task Force (RTF)

Mr. Wittmeyer reviewed RTF activities.

Other Business

There was no other business.

Adjournment

Ms. Henson adjourned the April 11, 2019 PRS meeting at 1:34 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at <http://www.ercot.com/calendar/2019/4/11/164972-PRS> unless otherwise noted [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. <http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR872#keydocs> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. <http://www.ercot.com/mktrules/issues/NPRR917#keydocs> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)