**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 8000 Metropolis Drive (Building E), Suite 100 – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Thursday, May 9,** **2024 – 9:30 a.m.**

Attendance

*PRS Representatives:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services (Reliant) | Via Teleconference |
| Blakey, Eric | Pedernales Electric Cooperative |  |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Goff, Eric | Residential Consumer | Via Teleconference |
| Hanson, Kevin | National Grid Renewables (NGR) |  |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor Electric Delivery (Oncor) |  |
| Lee, Jim | CenterPoint Energy (CNP) |  |
| Nguyen, Andy | Constellation Energy Generation (Constellation) |  |
| Pfefferle, Ryan | Occidental Chemical (Occidental) | Via Teleconference |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) |  |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services (Tenaska) |  |
| Winn, Aaron | Chariot Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Xie, Fei | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
|  |  |  |
| *Guests:* |  |  |
| Ainspan, Malcolm | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Amirazodi, Roozbeh |  | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Connor | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions (CES) | Via Teleconference |
| Ashley, Kristy | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Barati, Camron |  | Via Teleconference |
| Barr, Bill | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Benson, Maria | Texas Public Power Association (TPPA) |  |
| Bivens, Carrie | NextEra Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Block, Laurie | L Block Consulting | Via Teleconference |
| Boneck, Steve | Statar Capital | Via Teleconference |
| Bonskowski, Ned | Luminant Generation | Via Teleconference |
| Breiten, David | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Brown, Chris | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Bulzak, Jack | Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) | Via Teleconference |
| Bunch, Kevin | EDF Trading | Via Teleconference |
| Callender, Hudson | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Cheng, Yong | LCRA | Via Teleconference |
| Clark, Jack | Spearmint Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Cook, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Cortez, Sarai | Trailstone | Via Teleconference |
| Cotton, Ashley | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| Darden, Austin | Just Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Detelich, David | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Dharme, Neeraja | EDFT | Via Teleconference |
| Dreyfus, Mark | City of Eastland |  |
| Duensing, Allison | Sarac Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Ewing, Lee | CPower Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Fink, Regan | PG Renewables | Via Teleconference |
| Haley, Ian | Morgan Stanley |  |
| Harvey, Julia | Texas Electric Cooperatives (TEC) | Via Teleconference |
| Hassan, Imran |  | Via Teleconference |
| Headrick, Bridget | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Heino, Shari | Brazos Electric Cooperative | Via Teleconference |
| Heith, Mattie | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE North America (ENGIE) |  |
| Hjaltman, Courtney | Office of Public Utility Counsel (OPUC) | Via Teleconference |
| Holt, Blake | Lower Colorado River Authority (LCRA) |  |
| Hubbard, John | Texas Industrial Energy Consumers (TIEC) |  |
| Huynh, Thuy | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates | Via Teleconference |
| Jha, Monica | Vistra | Via Teleconference |
| Johnson, Shannon | PEC | Via Teleconference |
| Kee, David | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Keefer, Andrew | City of Denton | Via Teleconference |
| Keller, Jenna | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Keusch, Stephanie | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Kirby, Brandon | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| Kilroy, Taylor | TPPA | Via Teleconference |
| Kimbrough, Mandy | NRG | Via Teleconference |
| Koz, Brian |  | Via Teleconference |
| Lange, Clif | STEC | Via Teleconference |
| Loew, Beverly | Goff Policy | Via Teleconference |
| Lotter, Eric | Grid Monitor | Via Teleconference |
| Loving, Alicia | Austin Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Macaraeg, Tad | Stem | Via Teleconference |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company Associates |  |
| McDaniel-Wyman, Constance |  | Via Teleconference |
| McKeever, Debbie | Oncor | Via Teleconference |
| Mickey, Joel |  | Via Teleconference |
| Miller, Alex | EDF Renewables | Via Teleconference |
| Morais, Matt | NG Renewables | Via Teleconference |
| Morris, Sandy | WETT | Via Teleconference |
| Navarro, Jesus | Luminant | Via Teleconference |
| Nicholson, Tyler | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Pokharel, Nabaraj | OPUC |  |
| Reasor, Deidra | GVEC | Via Teleconference |
| Reed, Ronald | CNP | Via Teleconference |
| Reedy, Steve | CIM View Consulting | Via Teleconference |
| Reimers, Andrew | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Rich, Katie | Luminant Generation (Luminant) |  |
| Richmond, Michele | Texas Competitive Power Advocates (TCPA) | Via Teleconference |
| Ritch, John | Trafigura | Via Teleconference |
| Rodriguez, Jenny | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Safko, Trevor |  | Via Teleconference |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine Corporation (Calpine) | Via Teleconference |
| Sandidge, Clint | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Schmitt, Jennifer | Rhythm Ops | Via Teleconference |
| Scott, Kathy | CNP |  |
| Siddiqi, Shams | Crescent Power Consulting | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Caitlin | Jupiter Power |  |
| Smith, Mark | Mark Smith Law, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Snyder, Bill | AEP Texas | Via Teleconference |
| Spencer, Mark | Linebacker Power | Via Teleconference |
| Stephenson, Zach | TEC | Via Teleconference |
| Surendran, Resmi | Shell Energy North America (SENA) | Via Teleconference |
| Teng, Shuye | Constellation | Via Teleconference |
| Thomas, Wayne | Bryan Texas Utilities (BTU) | Via Teleconference |
| Trefny, Floyd | ERCOT Steel Mills | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | ACES | Via Teleconference |
| Uy, Manny | Hunt Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor | Via Teleconference |
| Walker, Floyd | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Walker, Mark | Mathews & Freeland, LLP | Via Teleconference |
| Williams, Lori | BTU | Via Teleconference |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power | Via Teleconference |
| Zachary, Brad | Got Rhythm | Via Teleconference |
| Zang, Hailing | TC Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Zhang, Mandy | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  |  |
| Abbott, Kristin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Albracht, Brittney |  |  |
| Anderson, Troy |  |  |
| Arth, Matt |  | Via Teleconference |
| Benavides, Marcos |  |  |
| Bigbee, Nathan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Billo, Jeff |  |  |
| Boren, Ann |  |  |
| Carswell, Cory |  | Via Teleconference |
| Castillo, Leo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Chu, Zhengguo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Clifton, Suzy |  |  |
| Dashnyam, Sanchir |  | Via Teleconference |
| Devadhas Mohanadha, Thinesh |  | Via Teleconference |
| Drake, Gordon |  | Via Teleconference |
| Dwyer, Davida |  | Via Teleconference |
| Garcia, Freddy |  |  |
| Gross, Katherine |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hailu, Ted |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hanson, Pamela |  |  |
| Heinrich, Holly |  | Via Teleconference |
| Heselmeyer, Sarah |  | Via Teleconference |
| Hinojosa, Luis |  | Via Teleconference |
| Holden, Curry |  | Via Teleconference |
| Jirasek, Shawna |  | Via Teleconference |
| King, Ryan |  |  |
| Magarinos, Marcelo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Maggio, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Mago, Nitika |  |  |
| McGuire, Josh |  | Via Teleconference |
| Mereness, Matt |  | Via Teleconference |
| Michelsen, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Miller, Megan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Morris, Sam |  | Via Teleconference |
| Neel, Evan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Opheim, Calvin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Patterson, Mark |  | Via Teleconference |
| Phillips, Cory |  |  |
| Ramthun, Eli |  | Via Teleconference |
| Ravulapalli |  | Via Teleconference |
| Rowe, Evan |  |  |
| Schmidt, Matthew |  | Via Teleconference |
| Shanks, Magie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Thompson, Chad |  | Via Teleconference |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  |  |
| Warnken, Pete |  | Via Teleconference |
| Wasik-Gutierrez, Erin |  |  |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Diana Coleman called the May 9, 2024 PRS meeting to order at 9:30 a.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Coleman directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-2)

*April 5, 2024*

Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update

Ms. Coleman reviewed the disposition of items considered at the April 15, 2024 TAC meeting.

Project Update (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided project highlights, summarized 2024 release targets, noted major projects,

reviewed the additional project status information items, and presented the priority and rank options for

Revision Requests requiring projects. Mr. Anderson announced the May 29, 2024 Technology Working Group (TWG) meeting.

*Review of Aging Projects*

Mr. Anderson reminded participants of the aging projects discussion at the March 20, 2024 PRS meeting and presented the revised analysis and ERCOT recommendations for approved Revision Request projects that have not yet been implemented in ERCOT systems and have the potential to be implemented prior to the Real-Time Co-optimization plus Batteries (RTC+B) project. Mr. Anderson highlighted challenges in the subset of Market Management System (MMS) items that PRS had requested ERCOT consider that ERCOT determined would impact the RTC+B project. Mr. Anderson noted the ERCOT effort to potentially pair Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1058, Resource Offer Modernization, with NPRR1131, FFSS Program Communication Improvements and Additional Clarifications, and requested Market Participant input on NPRR1006, Update Real-Time On-Line Reliability Deployment Price Adder Inputs to Match Actual Data, and NPRR1128, Allow FFR Procurement up to FFR Limit Without Proration. Market Participants expressed support for ERCOT Staff to prioritize NPRR1006 for potential to implement prior to RTC+B. Mr. Anderson stated that ERCOT Staff would continue to review for additional efficiencies and provide an update at a future PRS meeting.

Urgency Vote (Vote) (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1228, Continued One-Winter Procurements for Firm Fuel Supply Service (FFSS)*

Davida Dwyer summarized the request for Urgent status and provided an overview of NPRR1228. Market Participants reviewed the 5/2/24 Impact Analysis.

**Ian Haley moved to grant NPRR1228 Urgent status; to recommend approval of NPRR1228 as submitted; and to forward to TAC NPRR1228 and the 5/2/24 Impact Analysis. Kevin Hanson seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1229, Real-Time Constraint Management Plan Energy Payment (Waive Notice)*

**Lucas Turner moved to waive notice for NPRR1229. Bob Helton seconded the motion. The motion carried with four objections from the Consumer (Residential, OPUC, City of Eastland, Occidental) Market Segment and five abstentions from the Independent Generator (2) (NextEra Energy, EDF Renewables), Independent Power Marketer (IPM) (Tenaska), and Municipal (2) (CPS Energy, GEUS) Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

Mr. Turner reviewed the request for Urgent status. Austin Rosel reviewed the 5/7/24 ERCOT comments to NPRR1229. Market Participants expressed concern for the complexity of the issues, including make whole payments, settlement changes, and market design principles. Clif Lange responded to Market Participants questions and concerns.

**Mr. Turner moved to grant NPRR1229 Urgent status. The motion failed for lack of second.** Ms. Coleman noted that NPRR1229 will be considered at the June 13, 2024 PRS meeting.

*NPRR1230, Methodology for Setting Transmission Shadow Price Caps for an IROL in SCED (Waive Notice)*

**Mr. Helton moved to waive notice for NPRR1230. Mr. Hanson seconded the motion. The motion carried with two abstentions from the Independent Generator (Calpine) and Investor Owned Utilities (IOU) Linebacker Power Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

Freddy Garcia reviewed the request for Urgent Status. Some Market Participants expressed concern for Urgent status, noting communication issues with the concepts proposed in NPRR1230.

**Eric Goff moved to grant NPRR1230 Urgent status. Mr. Hanson seconded the motion. The motion carried with two objections from the Independent Generator (2) (Constellation, Calpine) Market Segment and six abstentions from the Independent Generator (Jupiter Power), IPM (Tenaska), IOU (Linebacker Power), and Municipal (3) (CPS Energy, GEUS, Austin Energy) Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

Mr. Garcia provided an overview of NPRR1230. In response to Market Participants questions and concerns, Dave Maggio reviewed the analysis and applicable concepts in potential scenarios. Market Participants offered clarifications to provide at least 30 days’ notice ahead of changing the Interconnection Reliability Operating Limit (IROL) Shadow Price caps in the future.

**Katie Rich moved to recommend approval of NPRR1230 as revised by PRS and to forward to TAC NPRR1230 and the 5/7/24 Impact Analysis. Mr. Henson seconded the motion. The motion carried with 12 abstentions from the Independent Generator (6) (Constellation, Jupiter Power, Calpine, NextEra Energy, ENGIE, EDF Renewables), IPM (3) (Tenaska, SENA, NG Renewables), IOU (Linebacker Power), and Municipal (2) (CPS Energy, GEUS) Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1198, Congestion Mitigation Using Topology Reconfigurations*

Market Participants reviewed the 4/5/24 PRS Report; 4/30/24 Impact Analysis, Reason for Revision, and Justification of Reason for Revision and Market Impacts; and discussed the appropriate priority and rank for NPRR1198.

**Ms. Rich moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 4/5/24 PRS Report and 4/30/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1198 with a recommended priority of 2025 and rank of 4520. Blake Holt seconded the motion.** **The motion carried with three abstentions from the Cooperative (STEC), Independent Generator (Calpine), and IOU (CNP) Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

*NPRR1218, REC Program Changes Per P.U.C. SUBST. R. 25.173, Renewable Energy Credit Program*

*NPRR1220, Market Restart Approval Process Modifications*

*NPRR1222, Public Utility Commission of Texas Approval of the Methodology for Determining Ancillary Service Requirements*

Market Participants reviewed the respective 4/5/24 PRS Reports and 3/5/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1218, 3/20/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1220, and 3/20/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1222. Ms. Coleman noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1223, Addition of TA Contact Information Into TDSP Application Form*

Market Participants reviewed the 4/5/24 PRS Report and 3/21/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1223 and offered clarifications to Section 9, Transition/Acquisition (“TA”), to align with NPRR1206, Revisions to QSE Operations and Termination Requirements, and Elimination of Providing Certain Market Participant Principal Information. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR956, Designation of Providers of Transmission Additions*

*NPRR1070, Planning Criteria for GTC Exit Solutions*

*NPRR1180, Inclusion of Forecasted Load in Planning Analyses*

*NPRR1188, Implement Nodal Dispatch and Energy Settlement for Controllable Load Resources*

*NPRR1191, Registration, Interconnection, and Operation of Customers with Large Loads; Information Required of Customers with Loads 25 MW or Greater*

*NPRR1200, Utilization of Calculated Values for Non-WSL for ESRs*

*NPRR1202, Refundable Deposits for Large Load Interconnection Studies*

*NPRR1214, Reliability Deployment Price Adder Fix to Provide Locational Price Signals, Reduce Uplift and Risk*

*NPRR1217, Remove VDI Requirement for Deployment and Recall of Load Resources and ERS Resources*

*NPRR1219, Methodology Revisions and New Definitions for the Report on Capacity, Demand and Reserves in the ERCOT Region (CDR)*

*NPRR1221, Related to NOGRR262, Provisions for Operator Controlled Manual Load Shed*

*System Change Request (SCR) 826, ERCOT.com Enhancements*

*SCR827, Grid Conditions Graph Addition for Operating Reserve Demand Curve (ORDC) Level*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR1190, High Dispatch Limit Override Provision for Increased NOIE Load Costs*

Market Participants noted the WMS endorsement of NPRR1190 as amended by the 3/26/24 Reliant comments.

**Ms. Rich moved to recommend approval of NPRR1190 as amended by the 3/26/24 Reliant comments. Mr. Hanson seconded the motion. The motion carried with four objections from the Consumer (4) (Residential, OPUC, City of Eastland, Occidental) Market Segment and eight abstentions from the Cooperative (PEC), Independent Generator (4) (Jupiter Power, NextEra Energy, ENGIE, EDF Renewables), (IPM ) (2) (Tenaska, SENA), and IOU (Linebacker Power) Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

*NPRR1215, Clarifications to the Day-Ahead Market (DAM) Energy-Only Offer Calculation*

Mr. Rosel reviewed the 4/12/24 ERCOT comments to NPRR1215. Market Participants noted the Credit Finance Sub Group (CFSG) endorsement of the 4/12/24 ERCOT comments. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1216, Implementation of Emergency Pricing Program*

Market Participants reviewed the 4/17/24 ERCOT comments and 5/1/24 WMS comments to NPRR1216. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1224, ECRS Manual Deployment Triggers – URGENT*

Nitika Mago provided an overview of NPRR1224, summarized discussion at the April 5, 2024 PRS meeting, and presented the Sensitivity Analysis for the proposed Power Balance Penalty based ERCOT Contingency Reserve Service (ECRS) manual deployment trigger. Market Participants reviewed the 4/30/24 TCPA comments, debated the appropriateness of a price floor for ECRS and an appropriate value for it, and proposed clarifications to the Revision Description to align with the Protocol revisions.

**Ms. Rich moved to recommend approval of NPRR1224 as amended by the 4/30/24 TCPA comments as revised by PRS and to forward to TAC NPRR1224 and the 3/27/24 Impact Analysis. Resmi Surendran seconded the motion. There were five opposing votes from the Consumer (4) (Residential, OPUC, City of Eastland, Occidental) and Independent Retail Electric Provider (IREP) (Reliant) Market Segments and six abstentions from the Cooperative (2) (STEC, PEC), Independent Generator (NextEra Energy), and Municipal (3) (CPS Energy, GEUS, Austin Energy) Market Segments.** (*Please see ballot posted with Key Documents).*

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1225, Exclusion of Lubbock Load from Securitization Charges*

Ms. Dwyer provided an overview of NPRR1225. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1226, Demand Response Monitor*

Floyd Trefny provided an overview of NPRR1226 and highlighted discussion of the concepts at the Apri1 1, 2024 Large Flexible Load Task Force (LFLTF) meeting. Market Participants requested further review of the issues at the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS). Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Notice of Withdrawal (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1162, Single Agent Designation for a QSE and its Sub-QSEs for Voice Communications over the ERCOT WAN*

Ms. Coleman noted the withdrawal of NPRR1162.

Combined Ballot

**John Varnell moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the April 5, 2024 PRS Meeting Minute as presented**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/5/24 PRS Report and 3/5/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1218**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/5/24 PRS Report and 3/20/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1220**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/5/24 PRS Report and 3/20/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1222**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 4/5/24 PRS Report as revised by PRS and 3/21/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1223**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1215 as amended by the 4/12/24 ERCOT comments**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1216 as amended by the 4/17/24 ERCOT comments**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1225 as submitted**
* **To table NPRR1226 and refer the issue to WMS**

**Mr. Hanson seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Other Business

*NPRR1231, FFSS Program Communication Improvements and Additional Clarifications*

Magie Shanks provided an overview of NPRR1231, noted that it would be discussed at the June 5, 2024 WMS meeting and for consideration at the June 13, 2024 PRS meeting, and encouraged participants to reach out to ERCOT Staff with any questions or concerns before the June meetings.

Adjournment

Ms. Coleman adjourned the May 9, 2024 PRS meeting at 12:39 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at <https://www.ercot.com/calendar/05092024-PRS-Meeting> unless otherwise noted [↑](#footnote-ref-2)