**APPROVED**

**Minutes of the Protocol Revision Subcommittee (PRS) Meeting**

**ERCOT Austin – 8000 Metropolis Drive (Building E), Suite 100 – Austin, Texas 78744**

**Thursday,** **September 12,** **2024 – 1:00 p.m.**

Attendance

*PRS Representatives:*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |
| Barnes, Bill | Reliant Energy Retail Services (Reliant) | Via Teleconference |
| Blakey, Eric  | Pedernales Electric Cooperative (PEC)  |   |
| Coleman, Diana | CPS Energy |  |
| Goff, Eric | Residential Consumer  |   |
| Henson, Martha | Oncor Electric Delivery (Oncor)  |   |
| Lee, Jim | CenterPoint Energy (CNP) |   |
| Mindham, David | EDP Renewables North America (EDP Renewables) | Via Teleconference |
| Nguyen, Andy | Constellation Energy Generation (Constellation) |   |
| Trevino, Melissa | Occidental Chemical (Occidental) |  |
| Turner, Lucas | South Texas Electric Cooperative (STEC) | Via Teleconference |
| Varnell, John | Tenaska Power Services (Tenaska) | Via Teleconference |
| Winn, Aaron | Chariot Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Xie, Fei | Austin Energy |   |
|  |  |  |
| *Guests:* |  |  |
| Aldridge, Ryan | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Almazan, Michelle | BP | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Connor | AB Power Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Kevin | Customized Energy Solutions (CES) | Via Teleconference |
| Ashley, Kristy | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Benson, Mariah | Texas Public Power Association (TPPA) | Via Teleconference |
| Bevill, Rob | Texas-New Mexico Power (TNMP)  |  |
| Bezwada, Neelima | Potomac Economics | Via Teleconference |
| Blackburn, Don | Hunt Energy Network Marketing | Via Teleconference |
| Block, Lauri | L Block Consulting, Inc. | Via Teleconference |
| Brown, Chris | Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) | Via Teleconference |
| Bruce, Mark | Cratylus Advisors | Via Teleconference |
| Calzada, Gricelda | AEP | Via Teleconference |
| Clark, Jack | Spearmint Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Cockrell, Justin | DC Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Considine, Lucy | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Cortez, Sarai | Trailstone | Via Teleconference |
| Cotton, Ashley | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| Cripe, Ramsey | SEnergy | Via Teleconference |
| Detelich, David  | CPS Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Donohoo, Ken | OwlERC, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Dreyfus, Mark | City of Eastland | Via Teleconference |
| Duensing, Allison | Sarac Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Espinosa, Chris | PCI Energy Solutions | Via Teleconference |
| Gant, Jim | Priority Power | Via Teleconference |
| Goff, Eric | Lancium – For NPRR1188 Only  |   |
| Haley, Ian | Morgan Stanley |   |
| Headrick, Bridget | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Heith, Mattie | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Helton, Bob | ENGIE |  |
| Holt, Blake | Lower Colorado River Authority (LCRA) | Via Teleconference |
| Hubbard, John Russ | Texas Industrial Energy Consumers (TIEC) | Via Teleconference |
| Jewell, Michael | Jewell and Associates |  |
| Jones, Monica | CNP | Via Teleconference |
| Keefer, Andrew | City of Denton | Via Teleconference |
| Kilroy, Taylor | TPPA | Via Teleconference |
| Koz, Brian | Wolframium Power | Via Teleconference |
| Lasher, Warren | Lasher Energy Consulting | Via Teleconference |
| Lotter, Eric | Grid Monitor | Via Teleconference |
| Macaraeg, Tad | STEM | Via Teleconference |
| McClellan, Suzi | Good Company Associates | Via Teleconference |
| McDaniel Wyman, Constance | Wyman Ideas, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| McDonald, Jeff | Potomac Economics |  |
| McMurray, Creighton | Spencer Fane | Via Teleconference |
| Miller, Alex | EDF Renewables | Via Teleconference |
| Neville, Zach | CES | Via Teleconference |
| Pokharel, Nabaraj | Office of Public Utility Counsel (OPUC) | Via Teleconference |
| Pyka, Greg | SEnergy | Via Teleconference |
| Reedy, Steve | CIM View Consulting |   |
| Rich, Katie | Luminant Generation (Luminant)  | Via Teleconference |
| Richmond, Michele | Texas Competitive Power Advocates (TCPA) | Via Teleconference |
| Sams, Bryan | Calpine | Via Teleconference |
| Scott, Kathy | CNP |   |
| Sersen, Juliana | Baker Botts  | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Caitlin | Jupiter Power | Via Teleconference |
| Smith, Mark | Mark Smith Law, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Stockard, Michael | Michael Stockard, LLC | Via Teleconference |
| Townsend, Paul | TCPA | Via Teleconference |
| True, Roy | ACES | Via Teleconference |
| Van Winkle, Kim | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Velasquez, Ivan | Oncor | Via Teleconference |
| Walker, Floyd | PUCT | Via Teleconference |
| Whigham, Dawud | BP | Via Teleconference |
| Wilson, Joe Dan | Golden Spread Electric Cooperative (GSEC) |  |
| Wittmeyer, Bob | Longhorn Power |  |
| Younger, Joseph | Texas Reliability Entity (Texas RE) | Via Teleconference |
| Zang, Hailing | TC Energy | Via Teleconference |
| Zhang, Mandy | GEUS | Via Teleconference |
| *ERCOT Staff* |  |  |
| Albracht, Brittney |  | Via Teleconference |
| Anderson, Troy |  |   |
| Arth, Matt |  | Via Teleconference |
| Azeredo, Chris |  | Via Teleconference |
| Bigbee, Nathan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Billo, Jeff |  | Via Teleconference |
| Boren, Ann |  | Via Teleconference |
| Castillo, Leo |  | Via Teleconference |
| Drake, Gordon |  |  |
| El-Madhoun, Mohamed |  | Via Teleconference |
| Fohn, Doug |  | Via Teleconference |
| Gnanam, Prabhu |  |  |
| Gonzalez, Ino |  |  |
| Gross, Katherine |  |   |
| Hanson, Pamela |  |   |
| King, Ryan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Lee, Alex |  | Via Teleconference |
| Li, Weifeng |  | Via Teleconference |
| Lofton, Amy |  |  |
| Maggio, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Mago, Nitika |  | Via Teleconference |
| Maul, Donald |  | Via Teleconference |
| Meier, Kennedy |  |  |
| Mereness, Matt |  | Via Teleconference |
| Michelsen, Dave |  | Via Teleconference |
| Morris, Sam |  | Via Teleconference |
| Opheim, Calvin |  |  |
| Patterson, Mark |  |  |
| Phillips, Cory |  |   |
| Ragsdale, Kenneth |  |  |
| Rainwater, Kim |  | Via Teleconference |
| Roberts, Randy |  | Via Teleconference |
| Rosel, Austin |  | Via Teleconference |
| Schue, Jamie |  |  |
| Shanks, Magie |  | Via Teleconference |
| Taurozzi, Tina |  | Via Teleconference |
| Tirupati, Venkat |  |  |
| Troublefield, Jordan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Wasik-Gutierrez, Erin |  |  |
| Yan, Ping |  |  |
| Zeplin, Rachel |  | Via Teleconference |
| Zhang, Bryan |  | Via Teleconference |
| Zhou, Emily |  | Via Teleconference |

*Unless otherwise indicated, all Market Segments participated in the votes.*

Diana Coleman called the September 12, 2024 PRS meeting to order at 1:00 p.m.

Antitrust Admonition

Ms. Coleman directed attention to the Antitrust Admonition, which was displayed.

Approval of Minutes (see Key Documents)[[1]](#footnote-2)

*August 8, 2024*

Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) Update

Ms. Coleman reviewed the disposition of items considered at the August 28, 2024 TAC meeting.

Project Update (see Key Documents)

Troy Anderson provided project highlights, summarized 2024 release targets, and presented the priority and rank options for Revision Requests requiring projects. Mr. Anderson reviewed the August 29, 2024 Technology Working Group (TWG) meeting agenda and encouraged participants to attend the September 26, 2024 TWG meeting. Mr. Anderson presented the Revision Request Projects Review on Impact Analysis Accuracy, highlighted variances in project costs and duration from 2021 through 2023, and responded to participant questions and concerns.

Urgency Vote (see Key Documents)

*Nodal Protocol Revision Request (NPRR) 1247, Incorporation of Congestion Cost Savings Test in Economic Evaluation of Transmission Projects*

Matt Arth reviewed the request for Urgent status to allow prompt implementation of planning requirements adopted by the Public Utility Commission of Texas (PUCT) in PUCT Project No. 53403. Prabhu Gnanam highlighted stakeholder discussions in developing the criteria for the congestion cost savings test and noted that ERCOT is drafting a white paper to provide additional details on how the congestion cost savings test will be performed. Mr. Gnanam also stated that a Revision Request is anticipated to incorporate the resiliency plus factor from the PUCT’s rule into the Protocols. Market Participants expressed concern for the complexity of the issues and declined to grant Urgent status. Ping Yan provided an overview of NPRR1247. Melissa Trevino reviewed the 9/11/24 TIEC comments to NPRR1247. Katie Rich noted NPRR1247 discussion at the August 13, 2024 Planning Working Group (PLWG) meeting and September 9, 2024 Reliability and Operations Subcommittee (ROS) meeting. Market Participants requested additional process details and tabled NPRR1247 for further review by PLWG. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Review PRS Reports, Impact Analyses, and Prioritization (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1188, Implement Nodal Dispatch and Energy Settlement for Controllable Load Resources*

Market Participants reviewed the 8/8/23 PRS Report for NPRR1188 and proposed clarifications to Section 10.3.2.3, Generation Netting for ERCOT-Polled Settlement (EPS) Meters, clarifying the communication related to installation of EPS Meters. Market Participants reviewed the 6/27/23 Impact Analysis, and discussed the Justification of Reason for Revision and Market Impacts, and the appropriate priority and rank for NPRR1188.

**Andy Nguyen moved to endorse and forward to TAC the 8/8/24 PRS Report as revised by PRS and the 6/27/23 Impact Analysis for NPRR1188 with a recommended priority of 2026 and rank of 390. Ms. Trevino seconded the motion. The motion carried unanimously.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1237, Retail Market Qualification Testing Requirements*

Market Participants reviewed the 8/8/24 PRS Report and 8/27/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1237. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1244, Related to NOGRR263, Clarification of Controllable Load Resource Primary Frequency Response Responsibilities*

Market Participants reviewed the 8/8/24 PRS Report and 9/6/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1244, offered clarifications to the title of NPRR1244 in response to ROS retitling NOGRR263 at their September 9, 2024 meeting, and discussed the appropriate priority and rank for NPRR1244. In response to participant questions and concerns, Mr. Anderson clarified that implementation of NPRR1244 is not dependent on NPRR1188. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Revision Requests Tabled at PRS (see Key Documents)

*NPRR956, Designation of Providers of Transmission Additions*

*NPRR1070, Planning Criteria for GTC Exit Solutions*

*NPRR1200, Utilization of Calculated Values for Non-WSL for ESRs*

*NPRR1202, Refundable Deposits for Large Load Interconnection Studies*

*NPRR1214, Reliability Deployment Price Adder Fix to Provide Locational Price Signals, Reduce Uplift and Risk*

*NPRR1229, Real-Time Constraint Management Plan Energy Payment*

*NPRR1234, Interconnection Requirements for Large Loads and Modeling Standards for Loads 25 MW or Greater*

*NPRR1238, Voluntary Registration of Loads with Curtailable Load Capabilities*

*NPRR1241, Firm Fuel Supply Service (FFSS) Availability and Hourly Standby Fee*

*NPRR1242, Related to VCMRR042, SO2 and NOx Emission Index Prices Used in Verifiable Cost Calculations*

*NPRR1243, Revision to Requirements for Notice and Release of Protected Information or ECEII to Certain Governmental Authorities*

*System Change Request (SCR) 826, ERCOT.com Enhancements*

*SCR827, Grid Conditions Graph Addition for Operating Reserve Demand Curve (ORDC) Level*

PRS took no action on these items.

*NPRR1180, Inclusion of Forecasted Load in Planning Analyses*

Market Participants reviewed the 8/28/24 ERCOT comments to NPRR1180.

**Jim Lee moved to recommend approval of NPRR1180 as amended by the 8/28/24 ERCOT comments. Martha Henson seconded the motion. The motion carried with two abstentions from the Independent Generator (Calpine, Constellation) Market Segment.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

*NPRR1226, Demand Response Monitor*

Ms. Coleman reminded participants of NPRR1226 discussion at the August 8, 2024 PRS meeting and the request for ERCOT Staff and Floyd Trefny to collaborate on concept deliverables. Mark Patterson presented ERCOT’s review of the concepts in NPRR1226, including data requirements, issues identified, and potential solutions and requested stakeholder input on potential next steps. Participants requested additional time to review the issues. PRS took no action on this item.

*NPRR1235, Dispatchable Reliability Reserve Service as a Stand-Alone Ancillary Service*

Ms. Rich encouraged interested stakeholders to attend the September 27, 2024 Supply Analysis Working Group (SAWG) meeting to discuss NPRR1235.

*NPRR1239, Access to Market Information*

*NPRR1240, Access to Transmission Planning Information*

Market Participants reviewed the 9/10/24 ROS comments to NPRRs 1239 and 1240. Ms. Coleman noted these items could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Review of Revision Request Language (see Key Documents)

*NPRR1245, Additional Clarifying Revisions to Real-Time Co-Optimization*

Dave Maggio provided an overview of NPRR1245, reviewed the 9/5/24 ERCOT comments, summarized discussions at the July 17 and August 14, 2024 Real-Time Co-optimization plus Batteries Task Force (RTCBTF) meetings, and proposed clarifications to align formula revisions within Section 4.4.12, Determination of Ancillary Service Demand Curves for the Day-Ahead Market and Real-Time Market. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1246, Energy Storage Resource Terminology Alignment for the Single-Model Era*

Kenneth Ragsdale provided an overview of NPRR1246 and noted the status of the related Revision Requests, including Other Binding Document Revision Request (OBDRR) 052, Nodal Operating Guide Revision Request (NOGRR) 268, and Planning Guide Revision Request (PGRR) 118. Market Participants reviewed the 9/10/24 ROS comments to NPRR1246 and noted that this suite of Revision Requests is anticipated to be discussed at the September 13, 2024 RTCBTF meeting. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1247, Incorporation of Congestion Cost Savings Test in Economic Evaluation of Transmission Projects*

This item was considered with Urgent status, as described above.

*NPRR1248, Correction to NPRR1197, Optional Exclusion of Load from Netting at EPS Metering Facilities which Include Resources*

Cory Phillips provided an overview of NPRR1248. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1249, Publication of Shift Factors for All Active Transmission Constraints in the RTM*

Steve Reedy provided an overview of NPRR1249. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1250, RPS Mandatory Program Termination*

Calvin Opheim provided an overview of NPRR1250. Michael Jewell reviewed the 9/10/24 SEIA comments to NPRR1250. Some participants expressed concern regarding the timing of NPRR1250 implementation in relation to House Bill 1500; other participants requested NPRR1250 retain confidentiality status. Market Participants requested review of the issues by the Wholesale Market Subcommittee (WMS). Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1251, Updated FFSS Fuel Replacement Costs Recovery Process*

Ino Gonzalez provided an overview of NPRR1251. Market Participants requested further review of the issues by WMS. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

*NPRR1252, Pre-notice for Sharing of Some Information, Addition of Research and Innovation Partner, Clarifying Notice Requirements*

Katherine Gross provided an overview of NPRR1252. Venkat Tirupati highlighted innovation and data challenges and the importance of having Research and Innovation (R&I) Partners to advance common research or innovation goals. Some participants expressed concern for disclosures and requested additional time to review the language and to consider if existing notice provisions are overly burdensome. Ms. Coleman noted this item could be considered for inclusion in the [Combined Ballot.](#Ballot)

Other Business

*Market Participant Guide for Suggesting Website Changes*

Amy Lofton presented established ways participants can offer feedback for system and digital channels, and provided email links for Market Information System (MIS), ERCOT Mobile App, and other requests submittal. Ms. Lofton stated that ERCOT is developing a process for ERCOT Dashboard and Displays feedback submittal, noted that a System Change Request (SCR) is not appropriate since it is not a system change, and responded to participant questions and concerns. Some participants expressed support for the SCR process as an established formal process for website changes and urged ERCOT to deliver an alternate solution expeditiously.

*October and November PRS Meetings*

Ms. Coleman reviewed potential meeting efficiencies for the October 17 and November 14, 2024 PRS meetings in consideration of PUCT Open meeting conflicts.

Combined Ballot

**Ms. Trevino moved to approve the Combined Ballot as follows:**

* **To approve the August 8, 2024 PRS Meeting Minutes as presented**
* **To table NPRR1247 and refer the issue to ROS**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 8/8/24 PRS Report and 8/27/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1237**
* **To endorse and forward to TAC the 8/8/24 PRS Report as revised by PRS and the 9/6/24 Impact Analysis for NPRR1244 with a recommended priority of 2025 and rank of 4530**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1239 as submitted**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1240 as submitted**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1245 as amended by the 9/5/24 ERCOT comments as revised by PRS**
* **To table NPRR1246**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1248 as submitted**
* **To recommend approval of NPRR1249 as submitted**
* **To table NPRR1250 and refer the issue to WMS**
* **To table NPRR1251 and refer the issue to WMS**
* **To table NPRR1252**

**Ms. Henson seconded the motion.** **The motion carried unanimously.** *(Please see ballot posted with Key Documents.)*

Adjournment

Ms. Coleman adjourned the September 12, 2024 PRS meeting at 3:52 p.m.

1. Key Documents referenced in these minutes may be accessed on the ERCOT website at <https://www.ercot.com/calendar/09122024-PRS-Meeting> unless otherwise noted. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)